

Rupesh

Advisor to Commissioner of the Supreme Court

IN THE CASE: PUCL Vs UOI and ORS. WRIT PETITION (Civil) NO. 196 of 2001

To  
The Chief Secretary  
Government of Bihar  
Patna, Bihar

Date:

Sub: In ref of case study on Starvation death in last few years in Bihar.

Dear Sir,

We wanted to draw your attention about some of the most excluded, destitute, socially devalued, invisible people for whom hunger and food denials are a way of life. It is constructed around the conviction about the intrinsic equal human worth of every human being, regardless of whether and what they produce and contribute; of their difference; their departures from social norms; their physiological and social diversity from the majority; their disenfranchisement and powerlessness.

During the team visit of particularly that village where many starvation death took place. Team observe that Food and work related government schemes are in very bad condition. In the dark shadows of this land, the silent tragedy plays out, of thousand of women and men, boys and girls, who sleep hungry. The experience of chronic hunger in distant villages, intense avoidable suffering; of self-denial; of learning to live with far less than the body needs; of minds and bodies stymied in their growth; of the agony of helplessly watching one's loved one's - most heartbreakingly children - in hopeless torment; of unpaid, arduous devalued work; of shame, humiliation and bondage; of the defeat and the triumph of the human spirit.

Government programmes are also woefully inadequate to address destitution; in fact they tend to be blind to or in denial of the fact that large numbers of people lack even the elementary means and power to survive with dignity. Our evidence is that apart from major leakages and corruption, the coverage of government food schemes is so meagre that they leave huge gaping holes in the social security net, through which large numbers of most destitute women and men, girls and boys slip into starvation and hunger.

---

**Office of the Advisor to Commissioner of the Supreme Court** [IN THE CASE: PUCL Vs UOI and ORS. WRIT PETITION (Civil) NO. 196 of 2001] Koshish, Abdin House, Fraser Road, Patna-800001 Phone: 6415355 Mobile- 9431021035, Email- koshish\_pt@ of [yahoo.com](mailto:koshish_pt@yahoo.com)  
**Office of the Supreme Court Commissioners** R-38 A Second floor south extension Part II New Delhi 1100049 Telefax +91 11 41642147 emailcommissioners@vsnl.net [www.supremecourtcommissioners.org](http://www.supremecourtcommissioners.org)

Rupesh

Advisor to Commissioner of the Supreme Court

IN THE CASE: PUCL Vs UOI and ORS. WRIT PETITION (Civil) NO. 196 of 2001

Our researcher team Mr. Santosh kr. Jha, Anees Ankur, Binit kumar and Pranve Bhartiya visited many districts where Starvation death cases Brought to light by print and electronic media in the last 2-3 years. Visited districts are Begusarai, Muzaffarpur, Gaya and Patna and so on. In the last week my self and along with Mr. Santosh Kr. jha went to Ratubigha village Noorsarai Block of Nalanda district and Jhhamawara village in Ghoshi block of Jahanabad district for Starvation death cases. In both cases, BDO was found dereliction in duty because he did not feel necessary to send body for postmortem or any medical report after death whenever he was informed by villagers and deceased's family members.

In coming days situation can worsen if all possible action will not be taken. Bihar is very badly affected with drought and flood. Central team also agrees with it. State and center government team also accept 26 districts are badly affected with drought. Out of 26 districts of Bihar 8 districts is extremely affected with it. Our suggestion is a time to make a concrete work plan and execution process to minimize effect of drought on common people in Bihar.

Truly,

Rupesh(Advisor)

Enclosure:

1. Brief report of Starvation death in Bihar
2. Details of cases study in Bihar
3. List of starvation death

C. C. to Commissioners of S C

---

**Office of the Advisor to Commissioner of the Supreme Court** [IN THE CASE: PUCL Vs UOI and ORS. WRIT PETITION (Civil) NO. 196 of 2001] Koshish, Abdin House, Fraser Road, Patna-800001 Phone: 6415355 Mobile- 9431021035, Email- koshish\_pt@ of [yahoo.com](mailto:koshish_pt@yahoo.com)

**Office of the Supreme Court Commissioners** R-38 A Second floor south extension Part II New Delhi 1100049 Telefax +91 11 41642147 emailcommissioners@vsnl.net [www.supremecourtcommissioners.org](http://www.supremecourtcommissioners.org)

Case Study

On  
Starvation death  
In

Bihar

**Rupesh**

**Advisor to Commissioner of the Supreme Court**

IN THE CASE: PUCL Vs UOI and ORS. WRIT PETITION (Civil) NO. 196 of 2001

**Office of the Advisor to Commissioner of the Supreme Court** [IN THE CASE: PUCL Vs UOI and ORS. WRIT PETITION (Civil) NO. 196 of 2001] Koshish, Abdin House, Fraser Road, Patna-800001 Phone: 6415355 Mobile- 9431021035, Email- koshish\_pt@ of [yahoo.com](mailto:koshish_pt@yahoo.com)

**Office of the Supreme Court Commissioners** R-38 A Second floor south extension Part II New Delhi 1100049 Telefax +91 11 41642147 emailcommissioners@vsnl.net [www.supremecourtcommissioners.org](http://www.supremecourtcommissioners.org)

***Upon publication of news item in different newspapers and other media about hunger deaths in different villages of Bihar. Shree Rupesh, Advisor of the commissioners of the Supreme Court formed Researchers Group; Mr. Santosh Kumar Jha, Mr. Anees Ankur, Mr. Binit Kumar and Mr. Pranav Bhartiya. Under the guidelines of Shree Rupesh investigated the truth behind in last 2-3 years of starvation death cases in Bihar. The Researcher group visited different districts for the study in Bihar during June 2009 to August 2009. Advisor Shree Rupesh himself visited in few cases. Its full report, given below, not only confirms deaths of the following due to hunger, but also reveals pathetic situation regarding implementation of food and social security schemes.***

### **1. Brief Case Study of Starvation Death in Bihar**

If large number of people dies of starvation, it occasionally captures media attention, and public outrage is transient. But government officials in every part of the country typically hotly deny allegations of starvation deaths and connect them with any disease. Some even quibble that people were just chronically malnourished, but not starving. Issues of food security and hunger surface briefly in public consciousness, when ever there are media reports on starvation deaths. The brief public outrage that follows such reports lead almost invariably to unseemly wrangles about whether this was indeed a starvation death, with angry denial by officials, postmortems and other evidence being mustered to establish that there was indeed some grain in the stomach of the diseased or available to the family and therefore this doesn't constitute a starvation deaths.

Apart from this, even the media and political establishment tend to react only when reports emerge of actual starvation deaths surface; reports of destitution that led to this final collapse fail to stir interest or action. There is in this sense, in both states and non-state circles a certain 'normalization' of destitution, of conditions in which people are forced to live with starvation. They can expect the state to act or public opinion to be outraged only when people begin to die.

Few people die directly and exclusively of starvation. They live with severe food deficits for long periods, and tend to succumb to diseases that they would have survived if they were well nourished. Official agencies tend not to recognize these as condition of starvation, and instead maintain that the deaths were caused by the proximate precipitating factor of infection. Starvation does not require absolutely zero food intake, but rather prolonged periods of such low food intake as to be incompatible with survival.

In the aftermath of media complaints of starvation deaths, while analyzing deaths due to starvation, the official investigator usually conduct a conventional enquiry in which he or she fires a serious of humiliating question soon after the death has taken place to the victims. This would only leave scars of the family of the deceased. The usual line of questioning is about whether the individual or family had access to any food at all in the period immediately preceding the death, or whether the death was due to illness or natural causes. There are sometimes post mortems to show even a few grains or wild leaves and tubers on the stomach, to demonstrate spuriously that the death was not due to starvation. The National human right commission in its investigation into alleged starvation deaths in Orissa some important and human principals have been established. First of these is that death is not necessary as evidence of starvation. In the words of Mr. chaman Lal, former special reporter of the National human right commission [NHRC], a person does not have to die to prove that he is starving. This insistence on death as a proof of starvation should be given up. Continuance of a distress situation is enough proof that a person is starving. We agree that Medical post mortem inquires do not serve much in the process of preventing starvation deaths and in assuring the right to food. Indeed, it hurts and humiliates those families' and communities who have lost peoples painfully to starvation. Citizens, especially the ones who are starving, have a right to dignity. Starvation is also rarely an isolated instance, but reflects instead prolonged denials of adequate nutrition to households, communities, or social categories. Such people are usually very impoverished and dispossessed or destitute

The discourse around, especially among public officials and the media, should shift in such times from not just those who died, but also who survived but are deeply threatened. They need to recognize starvation to be a condition not just of the dead but also of the living. It is crucial to understand and accept that death or mortality is not a pre-condition for providing the condition of starvation. Long- term unaddressed malnutrition and endemic prolonged phases of hunger must be recognized as situations of starvation, and the duty of the state to prevent deaths of persons who are living with starvation.

There are many ways that allegations, complaints, and fear of starvation arise. In any such situation, ideally the focus of the investigation by public officials should focus not on the dead, but on the living survivors, and people of the family, class or community who may be similarly threatened. This would ensure that the survivors of the deceased are not traumatized further, and measures for relief and prevention are put in place without delay. However, in practice, starvation deaths continue to be reported in media and Governments response tends to be mainly of denial, and of blaming the victim. In the commissioners office, in many cases we have observed that even after a death, no effort is made to provide immediate, short term and long term relief to the family of the deceased and people similarly threatened by starvation in the same settlement.

Schemes wise finding during Starvation Death study

#### **I. TPDS (Targeted Public Distribution System), AAY(Antyodaya Anna Yojana) and AY(Annapurna Yojana)**

- Common people problem of not getting information about rationing of Ration and kerosene.
- Do not get ration on time. Hardly any one getting Ration in every month
- Beneficiaries have also reported the incidences of fraudulent weight.
- Face a lot of difficulties in approaching the PDS shop during flood in the flood affected days
- Wheat and rice are not available under the TPDS.
- Ration shop allotted to dominant and unsocial background person.
- Poor quality of food grains is supplied.
- Forcibly ration coupons taken by ration dealer.
- Rarely open every week in the month.
- In many villages ration dealer keep ration coupon his/her own custody.
- Actual beneficiary not in the BPL list.
- Discrimination in supply of food grains in terms of the quantity.
- Beneficiaries do not know about price fixed by the government.
- Ration dealership license given to dominating caste in the villages
- Ration dealer distributes the Ration and kerosene only for 2-3 days in a month.
- Rarely any Mukhiya is ready to accept one quintal food grain given to distribute starvation affecting families
- The translated copies of the Supreme Court orders have not been displayed anywhere in the Gram Panchayat and in the PDS shop by the Government functionaries.
- The list of identified beneficiaries of TPDS has not been displayed anywhere in the Gram Panchayat and the PDS shop.
- The selection of beneficiaries has been done by the Government functionaries. No where make a list in Gram Sabha involved in the selection process.

#### **II. MDM(Mid Day Meal)**

- Cooked Meal not be served in every targeted school
- Very poor quality meal serve in School
- School do not provide plate for the Meal to all student
- Drinking water problem at many places

- Well cooked meal do not served
- More student enrolled to take advantages by school teacher
- False attendance shown in Student in attendance register
- In few school served meal on paper(newspaper)

### **III. ICDS(Integrated Child Development Schemes)**

- No trace of Aganwadi Center in Interior Villages
- No Grading Chart on center
- Nutritious food do not served
- Aganwari Sevika do not visit in the Villages
- Maximum Aganwadi Sevika do not have idea to make Grading Chart
- Rarely any Aanganwadi Centres, services are given to the adolescent girls.

### **IV. NOAPS(National Old Age Pension Scheme)**

- List of Beneficiary is biased
- Pensioner do not get timely pension
- BDO and Mukhiya wrongly select the beneficiary
- Very long process to make a old age pensioner card
- Actual beneficiary not in the beneficiary list

### **V. NMBS(National Mternity Benefits Schemes) Now known 'Janani Suraksha Yojana'**

- People rarely getting total payment under the schemes
- Without pay the bribe hospital authority do not deliver payment.
- All beneficiary do not get the benefits.

### **VI. NFBS(National Family Benefits schemes)**

- Common People do not know about this Schemes
- Official do not clear the payment soon
- In fact starvation death suffering family not getting the benefits under this Scheme

### **VII. NREGA(National Rural Employment Guarantee Yojana)**

- Job Card did not make to all beneficiaries
- Job Card holder do not getting the 100 days work
- Worker not getting the payment in stimulated period
- Maximum card holder is illiterate mediator taking the benefits for it
- Job card holder do not getting a work in rainy season

## Summary of few Starvation Death Cases in different Districts:

- 1) **Ratubigha in Jahanabad District:** Ratubigha village is 7 km from Ghoshi Block in Jahanabad District drew the attention of media and officer because starvation death case came into the light. Three deaths took place in four days. Mr. Chalitar Dome (45) died on at 12.30 pm on 10<sup>th</sup> August, 2009, Ms. Kunti Devi (46) on 11<sup>th</sup> August, 2009 and Mr. Janardan Mahto 13<sup>th</sup> August, 2009 at home of starvation. After the first death of Chalitar Dome villagers asked BDO for the post mortem to establish the starvation death case but BDO denied it and sent block staff for the funeral of deceased Chalitar Dome as early as possible. Deceased's son Ajay Dome said my father did not take any food in last 8 days. Late Chalitar Dome name was in the BPL list Mr. Ajay dome and his wife Ms Renu Kumari name is not in the BPL list. Descend family depended on traditional work bamboo stick made item but it was not sufficient to survive the family. Ajay said in the drought situation no one gets work in the village and people are also not in a condition to help us. After my father death BDO came and gave me word for Rs. 10,000/- under NFBS but still I did not get anything except Rs. 1000/- by Mr. Jagdish Sharma (M.P.), Rs. 1500/- by Mukhiya and 30 kg rice by BDO against two month ration coupon.

I do not get ration by the ration dealer. They keep it the ration coupon send us back without ration and kerosene. I do not get Job card or job under NREGA. We are not getting benefits of any government schemes. Our entire community is fighting with starvation; neither we are getting work under NREGA and nor any government facilities to survive in the drought situation.

- 2) **Jhamawara in Nalanda District:** Jhamawara village is 3 km from Noorsarai Block in Nalanda District drew the attention of media and officer because starvation death case came into the light. Due to lack of food three deaths took place in single family within fifteen days. Mr. Sarvan Majhi's wife Mrs. Phoolmanti Devi (35) and one year old son died the same day on 12<sup>th</sup> August, 2009, within four hours. Lost the wife and son, Sarvan Majhi lost his mother 15 days ago. due to starvation. Sarvan majhi said we have Antyoday Card but we do not get ration. We don't get any thing on Red card. After the death of my family members govt. issued us Job Card hurriedly.

We have received starvation death report from BDO. Noorjahan BDO wrongly mentioned that deceased family was living in Hariyana and had just returned two months ago. But it is not true. Truth is, he went Hariyana for limited time and returned three years ago. In the report, he mentioned Phoomanti Devi and her one old son death simultaneously but Srvan Majhi said when we return after son funeral my wife also dead on same day. Sarvan Majhi said he got Rs. 13000/- after three member in the family Rs. 3000/- for two member under Antysti Yojana, Rs. 10,000/- under NFBS, 40 kg rice and Rs.600/- from ration dealer. Except the above we did not get any thing.

- 1) **Danapur in Patna District:** On 22 August, 2007. Deceased Ms, Jaymanti Devi C/O Jago Bind died due to hunger as she had not eaten for several days. Bind community is situated on the Dam, at the bank of the channel where this village is devoid of basic facilities. Bind Basti is also known as Tej Lal Verma Nagar. In last two decades, people came in search of employment here. The Deceased family also came in search of job from the village Tarvani, thana-Sibhanu, Nalanda district and settled down. After sifting from village, problem of unemployment problem did not solve. Family name is in the BPL list but they do not get ration against ration coupon

The executive officer of Danapur Municipality says that, here no hunger death has taken place. Everybody here earns Rs 10,000. every month. Everybody's stomach is full with food. Jaymanti Devi's elder son says that no food was there in house to eat. Mother had become very weak and In fact she could not walk also. She became so weak that she died. In the name of governmental aid they got wood for funeral ceremony and after this they got 20 Kg Rice; they did not get anything from block and district administration, although ETV and Rastriya Sahara covered this issue.

## 2) Vishanpur Jagdish village(Bochan Block) Muzaffarpur District:

Bochan block is 25 km from Muzaffarpur on Darbhanga-Muzaffarpur National Highway. Village Vishanpur Jagdish 12 km far away interior from Muzaffarpur-Darbhanga National Highway where we went from Arther Ghat Bridge. In Vishanpur Jagdish village there is one tola named 'Ramai Nagar'. In Ramai Nagar 50 family are of Pasvan's. Flood and unemployment are main problem in this village. We went there in mid May 2009 and at that time village was struck by Cholera and people were dying of it. In this village Prabhu Pasvan died from hunger on 13 Feb, 2007.

This village has been in notice in the past, in this village English Kothi where Nobel Laurite Ravindra Nath Tagore used to stay for weeks. Decades before Darbhanga-Mujafferpur mainline way pass through this village. When name of one tola in Ramai Tola was after the name of one former minister of Bihar Ramai Ram that is Ramai Nagar, that time also it was talk of the town. This area of Bochaha block is flood prone area. Flood affected from river old Gandak. Still today the road here is not fit for four wheelers. Most of the time people here have to face flood and draught.

Deceased Prabhu Pasvan family has got ration card but instead of getting ration every month, they get ration one month in last three months. Ration dealer takes the three months coupon and gives only one months ration. On the name of ration they get 10kg wheat and they get 3 litres kerosene in 3 months. Since people don't get ration from ration dealer in flood and Cholera effected area problem has worsened. Due to not getting of ration poor people have to buy it from Bazar on high prices and they are left hungry. Resident of this village Mahindra Pasvan alleges that Rich Bhumihar and Brahmin family name is in the BPL list Ration dealer distributes ration to these people only.

We therefore felt that it would be useful to study in detail the state response in cases of alleged starvation a few years ago. We wish to understand the state response immediately after the death, and then in the medium and longer term. The survivors, people of the family, but also the class or community who may be similarly threatened. We also wish to see if there is any attempt to identify and address the food and livelihoods failures, and failures of governmental food and livelihood schemes and institutions to mitigate and address their sufferings, and to reverse these failures.

If we look very minutely in all cases, we can easily find it beneficiary do not getting the government schemes benefits. We did not get anywhere TDPS running properly and timely. Affected Families are not in condition to fight with administration to grab the benefits of the schemes. If government do not concrete work plan for them it can be uncontrollable very soon.

- 3) **Raghnathpur Village (Paru block) in Muzaffarpur District:** Raghnathpur village suddenly became the topic of discussion because Ms Ratiya Devi and Ms Kharouli Devi died due to hunger on 13<sup>th</sup> Feb, 2007. Media took the attention and gave full coverage two hunger death on same day and in same village. After this incidence no one came for help from Administration, Mukhia or villagers.

BDO was keeping pressure on Mukhia to give the report of Starvation death in the village. Mukhia cleverly sent 200 Rs to family of Ratiya Sevi and Kharouli Devi for conducting *Bhoj for Biradari*. During the *Bhoj* Mukhiya person took the photo of people eating in *Bhoj* and he sent this photo to BDO and said that how a person can give such a big Bhoj in whose family somebody has died due to hunger. Mukhia Shree Ambika Pasvan sent the report to BDO that the death of Khrouli Devi and Ratiya Devi was due to disease not of hunger. In this way death of Ratiya Devi and Khrouli Devi was due to hunger but Mukhia made due to illness in the report for the BDO. This is the reason that two Deceased families did not get any benefit from district administration. Son of kharouli Devi Misri Lal Sahani says that instead of helping Mukhia made a

plot and very cleverly converted starvation deaths into death due to illness and sent a wrong report to the BDO.

Antyodaya and Annpurna Card have been given to Ms Kharouli Devi's family but they don't get ration on that card. When Misri Lal was asked about not getting ration he says that we don't get any benefits of government schemes and facility. Ration dealer does not give us anything. In a year he gives us grain only once or twice. No one can dare to ask about ration and if anybody dares to ask for ration he scolds them. Due to not having grains we have to eat sattu only. He showed the coupon of 1-2 years in which they did not get ration except only on two occasions. Misri Lal Sahni says that when we go to take ration, dealer takes the entire old coupon and gives the ration of one month. This is the situation of all the Pasvans families in the village. All the Pasvans and the Dalits of the village complain that they don't get ration regularly.

- 4) **Banawara village in Gaya district:** In Tulsi Manjhi family in Banwara district three people died within two days due to hunger. Late Gita Devi, Late Sumita Devi and one six days old child. Only in Gamharia village of this block of Agara Panchayat, Vinod Mandal (30 years) died of hunger on April 2005. In the same village Mahachandra Mandal (55 years) died of hunger on June 26. Two sons of Mahachandra Mandal, Dharmendra (15 years) and Saryug (20) are still there and wife Bedami Devi is still living. Gaya is the oldest city of the country. Government claims good governance but more than 20 people have died of hunger alone in Gaya.

Although in Gaya only more than 20 people have died of hunger but the incident of Banwara village has shaken everybody. In this village in the family of Tulsi Manjhi 3 people have died within 2 days of hunger. Person who are dead are Late Gita Devi (45), Late Sumita Devi (26) and one six days child. This incident spread like wild fire and wasting no time BDO came and gave 10,000 Rs as family welfare and Mukhia gave 20 Kg Rice and 10 Kg flour. After this they have not got anything.

- 5) **Chamatha Village in Begusarai District:** Chamatha Village in Bachhawara Block is 22 km far away from district town Begusarai. In this village Balgovind Pasvan died of hunger on 1<sup>st</sup> August, 2006. Chamatha village in Bachhawara block is economically and socially advanced. The richness of this village could be seen from the big market here. Two categories of people can be seen in this village. On one side rich feudal lords (Bhumihar, Rajput) and on the other side 30-35 families of Pasvan's. Economic, social and political all the three have been captured by feudal lords. The economic and social inequality is also a cause of Balgovind's death. Balgovind Pasvan's son Ramjeevan Pasvan has got a ration card but he hardly gets ration on that card. When Ramjeevan Pasvan is asked about not getting of ration he says that "I am a poor person and illiterate. I cannot fight with ration dealer. Ration dealer keeps the coupon of three-four months and gives the ration of one month. In ration they give 5 Kg Rice, 5Kg Wheat and three liters kerosene."

Balgovind Pasvan did not get Job Card under NREGA. This village is totally Bhumihar dominated. They grab all government schemes. After his death, deceased family did not get Rs.10,000/- under NFBS. Descend Family did not get anything more.

## 2. Detailed Case Study

### Starvation Death Study of Danapur (Patna) Case Study no.-3

Patna is the capital of Bihar has been an important place in Indian history. Patna has not been the capital of Bihar only but at the time of Mouryan period Patliputra was the capital of entire India. Patliputra in time being know as Patna. Patna City is situated at the bank of river Ganges. Between Patna and Danapur there is a canal, east side of Kusumpur there is a Bindo Community Basti. This bindo basti remember the Paleolithic period in mind. On 22 Agust, 20007 Descend Ms, Jaymanti Devi C/O Jago Bind died due to hunger as she was so hungry from several days. Jaymanti Devi died of hunger is not a new thing in Danapur as this is very common here. Bindo community is situated on the Dam, at the bank of the channel where this village is devoid of basic facilities. On the other hand 200m from here Kusumpur is equipped with all modern facilities. Here houses of businessmen and high status people can be found. People here might not be knowing that there is a basti where people don't get to eat and remain hungry. Governmental people don't give any governmental facilities to these people.

Bindo Basti is also known as Tej Lal Verma Nagar. In last two decades, people came for search the employment here. The descend family also in search of job came from the village Tarvani, thana-Sibhanu, Nalanda district and settled down. After sifting from village, problem of unemployment did not solve. Unemployment is a common problem for entire Bindo community. If we get work for four months then next we don not get work in next four months. And its direct gain goes to contractor employer. He keeps anybody he likes and gives the wage according to his own wish. Worker get work on his contractor employer. When asked about descend Ms Jaymanti Devies death, Nagendra Singh says that from several days she had left the work. Her husband was not getting work from several days. In rainy season people hardly gets any work. There was no food in the house. We sometimes gave food to their children. From the same basti Birju Bind says that our condition is also not good how can we feed other family. We all get work as a daily wage. If we don't get work then we don't get to food.

Local reporter of Dainik Hindustan Newspaper says that at the place were agriculture was done, people are making houses therefore place of doing farming is being snatched. Due to unemployment people are dying of hunger. Some workers join *Bhatti* as a work where due to compulsion there blood is sucked. They don't have money so they are not able to buy ration. On the question of death due to hunger local Councilor Ms Veena Kumari says that it is true Jaymanti Devi has died of hunger but their family members did not give us the information. If they had given us the information we could have done something. When she was asked that what did she do later on, she shuts her mouth. The executive officer of Danapur Municipality says that, here no hunger death has taken place. Everybody here earns Rs 10,000. every month. Everybody's stomach is full with food. Jaymanti Devi's elder son says that no food was there in house to eat. Mother had become very weak and In fact she could not walk also. She became so weak that she died. On the name of governmental aid they got wood for funeral ceremony and after this they got 20 Kg Rice; they did not get anything from block and district administration, although ETV and Rastriya Sahara covered this issue.

Sonu Kumar says that after the death of mother our small family was destroyed. My mud made house has fell down. Our father sometimes stays in village and sometimes in Patna. Now he has also become weak and not fit for work. I live in this Basti and mostly sleep on the road. We also don't get to work most of the time. Sometimes we get and sometimes I also don't get.

#### **Situation of Various Governmental Scheme**

**Public Distribution System:** Problem here of ration is also not different from another part in Bihar. About ration, Sonu Kumar says we don't get ration on time. Form several months, we don't get it.

When they were said to show the coupon of ration, they said that they have got the coupon but for no use. Still today all family did not get BPL card. BPL card holder family said we should get Antyodaya And Anpoorna Card. Sonu Kumar shows the coupon of three months of previous year i.e. 2008 and says that this year also we did not get ration for several months.

- From the same Basti Nagendra Kumar Singh says that we don't get ration regularly. Dealer doesn't give ration every month. If we talk for one year we get ration for 6 months only.
- From the same basti Birju Bind says that we don't get the information when ration will be distributed.
- The Member of Municipal Corporation of this ward Ms Veena Kumari's husband Ramesh Kumar who looks after all the official works of his wife, says that with lots of difficulty we have put the names of Bindo community members in the BPL list and still some are in abeyance. He next says that instead of giving coupon of 12 months we have given coupon of 11 months for ration because one months ration coupon has been sent to flood relief. With this he says that when the ration comes I give information to whole community. Rashion dealer house very far from the Bindo community. So I instruct the dealer distribute the Rashion at my home because my house nearly located from Bindo community. We accept that now end of the July month, till today june month Rashion not distributed. Local reporter of Hindustan Subodh Lal Kirtiman says that person who are beneficiaries also don't get ration. Sometimes they don't have enough money to buy ration.
- Danapur Block BDO Shivranjan says that rashion distribution is not my duty. Only Municipal Corporation is responsible for it.
- The Executive Officer of Danapur Municipal Corporation D.K Jha says that my work is to distribute coupon only, not giving ration. Whether ration has been distributed or not, I am not meant to see that. For making BPL list one NGO did the survey and according to that work only APL, BPL, Antyodaya and Annapurna list has been made. We do only that which SDO says. We don't do anything on our wish.
- When we talked to Rashion dealer Jitendra about this, he told that ration has not been distributed from 2 months. We have submitted the draft to the distribution for ration but we have not got ration from the division as yet. When he was asked that from how many months ration has not been distributed from previous year he says that from April, May, June, July, ration has not been distributed. Now month of August is going on.

## **NREGA**

Since this is the city area, NREGA scheme is not applicable here.

## **NFBS**

Son of the descend Sonu Kumar says that they have not got any benefit from this scheme. About this ward member Veena Kumari says that we were not told anything. Postmortem was also not done so death certificate could not be made. If we knew about this we must have done something But she not ready speak about any thing to speak any word about what she going to do for the descend family.

## **ICDS**

Sonu Kumar Says that my younger brother Bholu goes to Anganbari centre. But he does not get any nutritious food there. Anganbari Centre does not open everyday. Children cannot go due Anganwari center is very far away. About this, member of municipal corporation Veena Kumari says that, we have given application to BDO for opening new Anganbari center in the community and In this regard we also approached to ICDS officer but no action has been taken as yet. BDO Shivranjan says that to open ICDS centre (Anganbari) is not under the power of ICDS officer. Decision is taken by very high officials. We can only recommend.

## **Indira Avas Yojna**

This area comes under town so it does not avail Indira Avas Yojna. This area of Bindo comes under Danapur Municipal Corporation, Ward member (Ward No.-37) Ms Veena Kumaries husband Ramesh Kumar says that all these families should get the benefit of Jawaharlal Nehru City Development Scheme. In this scheme one family should get Rs 35000 but nobody has got the benefit of this scheme till now. Ramesh Kumar next says that in coming days these people might need to remove their huts from here because on both sides of the Channel, on one side railway line and on the other side wide road will be made. Ramesh Kumar could not speak anything whether government has got any alternative for this or not. When people of basti were asked about this, they say that they met several senior officials but no body could give the answer properly.

## **Drinking Water**

Savor problem of drinking water here. People don't get to pure water for drink. Three-four hand pump on nearly 200 bindo family. Where there are only 3-4 Hand pumps. These hand pumps have been put by mutual cooperation (donation). Women and children bring water from far away. When there is so much problem of drinking water one can anticipate that how much problem there would be for bathing and washing the clothes. About the problem of drinking water BDO of Danapur says that BDO does not have any fund on which he can give order to put hand pump but I commit that I will write to concern division about this. Now it would be on them that they listen to us or not.

## **Mid Day Meal Scheme**

In Jaymanti Devi's family there is nobody to go to school. But when we talked to other children they say that we don't get food regularly. They give *Khichari* only with no vegetable.

## **Primary Health Centre**

In this area there is no Primary Health Centre. Big problem also they have to go to the Shastri Nagar Patna. Persons who come with some VIP source are only entertained here and they only get medicine for free. General people cannot get medicine here. After lots of altercation they get medicine for 2-3 days that also which is very cheap. Here one should get medicine according to the course of treatment. Due to these irregularities people here are dependent on private doctor's .Birju Bind says that private doctors do not do treatment but loots the general people. But Due to compulsion we have to go to these doctors only. There is lots of popularity of quacks but government doesn't do anything for this. Ramesh Kumar also says that in ward no. 37, 38, 39 and 40 there is no Primary Health Centre.

## **NOAPS**

There are several beneficiaries of this scheme in the Basti but nobody is getting it. About this Sonu Kumar says that my father is eligible for this but he is not getting it although we have tried for it several times. Ramesh Kumar says that since everybody in this Basti does not have voter card that's why they are not getting the benefit of this scheme. Next he says that for making voters cards we made papers on which signature was done but related office made the card of very few persons. They stopped other persons saying that first bring the certificate of surrendering of voter card of the place where they use to live before then only it is possible. He says that bring Residential Certificate otherwise none of them will get voters card.

## **Disability**

There is no disabled person in Descend Jaymanti Devi's family

## **Employment and Work**

Late Jaymanti Devi's son Sonu Kumar says that we don't get work daily. This depends on Contractor. He gives work whenever he wishes to give work. Otherwise we have to live without work. Sonu Kumar reiterates that my father has become very weak. He is not able to do labor. We get daily wage amounting to Rs 100. We don't have house to live. We don't have this much money also that we can re-erect our fallen house. I live in this Basti only and at night I sleep in open sky. On the name of food I eat *Litti* or *Sattu* before sleeping and that's why I feel myself weak.

Death of Jaymanti Devi is not merely an incidence but a proof of social disability and corruption in the governmental sector. Executive officer of Danapur Municipality D. K. Jha says that god has given us two hands then also if somebody dies of hunger, what can we do. If government and Bureaucrat think that making good roads and big building is development then a time will come when social inequality will increase so much that it will become uncontrollable.

## **Hunger death of Prabhu Pasvan at Bochaha Block in Muzaffarpur Case study no, - 4**

Bochan block is 25 km from Muzaffarpur on Darbhanga-Muzaffarpur National Highway. Village Vishanpur Jagdish 12 km far away interior from Muzaffarpur-Darbhanga National Highway where we went from Arther Ghat Bridge. In the village Vishanpur Jagdish there is one tola named 'Ramai Nagar'. In Ramai Nagar 50 family are of Pasvan's. Flood and unemployment are main problem in this village. We went there on mid may 2009 and at that time village was stuck by Cholera and people were dying of it. In this village Prabhu Pasvan died from hunger on 13 Feb, 2007.

This village has been in notable in the past, in this village English Kothi where Nobel Laurite Ravindra Nath Tagore uses to stay for weeks. Decades before Darbhanga-Mujafferpur mainline way pass through this village. When name of one tola in Ramai Tola was on the name of one former minister of Bihar Ramai Ram that is Ramai Nagar, that time also it was talk of the town. This area of Bochaha block is flood prone area. Flood affected from river old Gandak. Sill today the road here is not fit for four wheelers. Most of the time people here have to face flood and draught.

Descend Prabhu Pasvan was a unorganized sector labor. He use to do the work of Gharami (work of houses made of Straw). In this work he uses to earn Rs 50 per day that of working in a field he uses to get 20-25 Rs per day only. Dcscend Prabhu Pasvan use to get work for hardly 20 days in a month. In one month he earned Rs 1000 and this only he looked after the family. The flood and draught destroyed the entire village economy and mostly Pasvan family. In the population of this village 35-40 houses are of Pasvan and 8-10 houses are of Bhumihar. Most of the land of this area has been captured by Bhumihar. Thus, Pasvan of this village are economically, socially and politically backward. Flood and after that draught has destroyed everything on one side and on the other side due to not getting of work, family of Prabhu Pasvan got very less food. This was the way they were living. Suddenly Prabhu Pasvans stomach started paining. Family members started his treatment. Whatever money was in the houses was exhausted in the treatment only. Beauru Chief Ravindra Singh of Prabhat Khabar says that workers here are dependent on agriculture and agriculture is dependent on whether. Due to flood and draught agriculture has been always effected.

In last one month there was no grain in the house. Whole family used to eat very less. 10-12 days before dying members of the family had started living hungry. Children use to eat anywhere. Suddenly Prabhu Pasvan died of hunger.

1. Asking about death of Prabhu Pasvan, his wife says that we were asking for food everywhere but we could not find anywhere. There was no money in the house so he died of hunger.
2. Mahindra Pasvan of the same village says about the death of Prabhu Pasvan that he was a healthy person. He was a man who can earn and sustain others also. Due to not getting food he died.
3. Ahilya Kumari who runs Anganbari Centre says about the death of Prabhu Pasvan that he died of hunger and illness also.
4. Asking about the death Descend Prabhu Pasvan from Mukhia Yogendra Mahato, he says that we had given old age pension card to him. He has died not of hunger but from desease. Night and day he use to drink. For this he has died.
5. Prabhat Khabar Beauru- Chief Ravindra Singh says that in the initial period news were given but later they could not follow.

There are 10 members in Prabhu Pasvans family. His wife's name is Siya Devi whose age is 75 years. He has one son whose name is Babulal Pasvan. Babulal Pasvan age is 40 years and his wife's name is Manju Devi . Babulal Pasvan has 4 sons and 2 daughters. Name of his four sons are Anil, Anand, Dharmendra, Kumaya. Name of daughters are Anila and Sunila. Age of sons and daughters are between 5 years to 16 year.

Late Prabhu Pasvan (68-70)  
Wife- Siya Devi (75)

Babulal Pasvan (40)  
Manju Devi

Anil, Anand, Dharmendra, Kumaya

Anila, Sunila

Health of the family of Prabhu Pasvan is still bad. At the time of the death of Prabhu Pasvan, his wife's whole body was paining. Her daughter-in-law Manju Devi was ill. Babulal's eldest son Anil is handicapped from one eye. At this time also Babulal's daughter Anila is suffering from Cholera.

### **Situation of Different Governmental Scheme**

#### **Public Distribution system**

Descend Prabhu Pasvan's family has got ration card but instead of getting ration every month, they get ration one month in last three months. Ration dealer takes the three months coupon and gives only one month's ration. On the name of ration they get 10kg wheat and they get 3 litres kerosene in 3 months.

Since people don't get ration from ration dealer in flood and Cholera affected area problem has worsened. Due to not getting of ration poor people have to buy it from Bazar on high prices and they are left hungry.

Resident of this village Mahindra Pasvan alleges that Rich Bhumihar and Brahmin family name is in the BPL list Ration dealer distributes ration to these people only.

- One can know the irregularity in the distribution of ration by seeing their ration card only. From last six months people of Ramai Tola did not get ration. Villagers have allegation that ration dealer do black marketing of the entire ration in the open market. Everybody eats away the entire ration meant for poor whether he is Mukhia, Ration Dealer or BDO.
- BDO of Bochaha block Ashutosh Kumar says about hunger death that if any poor dies people makes it a hunger death. Some people have made it a profession.
- Asking question about distribution of ration to some special caste Ashutosh Kumar Verma says that at lower level there is no question of caste.
- Asking about distribution of ration Ashutosh Kumar says that NREGA, Anganwari, ration Card nothing is in our hands. Project Officer is looking after NREGA, Anganwari is in the hands of CDPO and ration is under Block supply Officer.
- Questioning Mukhia (Yogendra Mahato) about unequal distribution of ration, he says that for all of these BDO is responsible. Reckoning BPL card and ration both are the work of block. Mukhia has nothing to do with this.
- Mukhia said that we submitted written complain in block but till now no action has been taken. This is the responsibility of BDO. Making BPL card, ration card, Job card is the responsibility of BDO, not mine.

#### **National Family Benefit Scheme**

- According to these schemes, victim families have not got anything from the side of government.
- Babulal Pasvan says that, I met BDO, Mukhia, Sarpanch and other high people but for no use.
- BDO Ashutosh Kumar gives the word that action will be taken soon.

- According to Mukhia Yogendra Mahato, he does not have any say in this planning. If he had this he must have given it to Babulal's family.

### **Mid Day Meal**

According to this schemes school children are given to meal in the Lunch time. But Prabhu Pasvans family is not aware about gifts of education so no child goes to school in this family. Due to this they remain bereft of this advantage. Mahinder Pasvan of the same village says that how can our children go to school? We don't have proper cloth to wear and in spite of this teacher asks registration charge up to Rs 100-150.

### **Anganbari Centre**

In this village there is one Anganbari Centre. Anganbari Centre is situated at the back of the house of Descend Prabhu Pasvan, which is run by Ahilya Kumari. Ahilya Kumari says that up till now registration of 40 children has been completed in which 35 children come to the centre. Here 8 pregnant women and 8 *Dhatri* woman also comes. They get 2Kg grain in every 15 days.

- Children of Babulals family do not come to Anganbari centre. When Ahilya Kumari was asked she says that, when children will come then only we can give them anything. We cannot drag them from house.
- In connection of not getting of Sattu and Sugar to children Anganbari Sevika Ahilya Kumari says that from last 2 months Sattu have not get from government that's why it has been not distributed. But Mahendra Pasvan of the village says that Sattu and Sugar are always available. She sells them all. Manju Devi says that whenever we go to the centre she gives chocolate.

### **Indra Avas Yojna**

Under this scheme BPL families get Rs 35,000 for making house from government. Descend Prabhu Pasvan has got the benefit of this scheme. Mukhia Yogendra Mahato says that just after the death of Prabhu Pasvan I gave the facility of Indra Avas to Babulal Pasvan. But uptill now several BPL families have not got the benefit of this scheme. Lalan Pasvan says that still for enjoying the benefit of Indra Avas one has to give bribe of Rs 8000.

### **National Old Age Pension Scheme (NOAPS)**

Descend Prabhu Pasvan use to get old age pension. But after his death his wife Siya Devi has not been able to make old age pension card.

- On old age pension Wife of Late Prabhu Pasvan, Siya Devi says that, I am 70 years old, then also I met Mukhia Ji but till now I did not get any pension.
- About not making of old age pension card Mukhia says that we have done the recommendation but why they are not making it.

### **National Maternity Benefit Scheme**

Villagers do not have any knowledge about this scheme. That's why they are not getting any benefit of this scheme.

### **NREGA**

Under National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme provision has been made that BPL families will get 100 days work in a year. But Babulal Pasvans name is in BPL list then also he has not got

Job card. In whole village situation of NREGA is very bad. Most of the people do not have Job card. Persons who have job card they also don't get employment for 100 days or unemployment allowance.

- Madan Pasvan of the village says that we have job card but it is of no use if we don't get job out of that.
- About not having job card with Babulal Pasvan, Mukhia says that we have recommended to high officials (BDO), when order will come that more Job card will be made.

### **Drinking Water**

Descend Prabhu Pasvans family has got a Handpump. This handpump was given to Babulal Pasvan when his father died.

### **Primary Health Centre**

In this village there is no Primary Health Centre due to which villagers have to face lots of difficulty.

### **Disability**

The eldest son of Babulal Pasvan is handicap from one eye. Since, he does not have Disability Certificate so he never got any government benefits. Family member do not have idea, How Disability Certificate can be made.

### **Property**

On the name of property, they have 7 *Kattha* Land. On this land they do the agriculture of Maize and Wheat. From 7 *Kattha* land they produce 70-75 Kg Maize.

Call it a misfortune or merely a chance that There was a time when in this village (English Kothi in Bishanpur Jagdish) Ravindra Nath Tagore use to stay for weeks and wrote articles on Social values. Today in the same village call it antisocial sentiment or rotten governmental system, where one backward caste remains hungry for days. For taking the benefit of governmental scheme they are not able to fight with politically and socially dominated caste and high officials but they are prompt in embracing death.

**Starvation Death Report of Muzaffarpur(Paru Block)**  
**Case Study no. - 5**

Paru block is 28 km far away from Muzaffarpur District head quarter on Chhapara- Muzaffarpur highway. Raghunathpur village situated in this Block. This village suddenly became the topic of discussion because Ms Ratiya Devi and Ms Kharouli Devi died due to hunger on 13<sup>th</sup> Feb, 2007. Media took the attention and gave full force on two hunger death in same day and same village. After this incidence no one came for help from Administration, Mukhia or villagers. Prabhat Khabar Bureau Chief Ravindra Singh says that in the beginning this news was put on cover page but we could not do the follow up. The way this issue BDO also had to tell the Mukhia to give the report.

Ms Kharouli Devi's son says that, when my mother died I was not at home. I use to do labor in Muzaffarpur. After listening about mother death I came to the village. After the death of mother I did not have the money to do *Bhoj for Biradari*, People of community started saying that if you don't do *Bhoj for Biradari*, we will not even take water from your house and we will oust you from community. I was very afraid to know about community people can oust me from community if I will not do the *Bhoj for Biradari*. I took money on credit from several people of the village and gave *Bhoj for Biradari*. Same condition was in Ratiya Devi's house. People said that if you don't do the *Bhoj for Biradari* we will throw you out of the community. We were afraid of this they did everything for *Bhoj for Biradari*.

BDO was putting pressure on Mukhia to give the report of Starvation death in the village. Mukhia cleverly sent 200 Rs to family of Ratiya Devi and Kharouli Devi for conducting *Bhoj for Biradari*. During the *Bhoj* Mukhiya person took the photo of people eating in *Bhoj* and he sent this photo to BDO and said that how a person can give such a big *Bhoj* in whose family somebody has died due to hunger. Mukhia Shree Ambika Pasvan sent the report to BDO that the death of Kharouli Devi and Ratiya Devi was due to disease not for hunger.

In this way death of Ratiya Devi and Kharouli Devi was due to hunger but Mukhia made due to illness in the report for the BDO. This is the reason that two descend families could not get any benefit from district administration. Son of kharouli Devi Misri Lal Sahani says that instead of helping Mukhia made a plot and very cleverly made hunger death a death due to illness and sent a wrong report to the BDO.

In Raghunathpur which is in Paru block, there are 60-70 houses of Pasvan. Mukhia is also from Pasvan community. In this village there are only 10-15 houses of Bhumihar. The economic, social and political aspect of village has been captured by Bhumihar people. Most of the people of Pasvan caste in this village is landless. Mukhia Ambika Pasvan also works for Bhumihars only. There is one PDS Shop in the village which is also of a Bhumihar. In this way people of Pasvan Caste complains that Mukhia is of our caste but works only for Bhumihars. Farming and agriculture labor is the main job of the villagers. In this village Pasvan caste mainly do agricultural labor. Hardly they manage single time food to earn 25-30 Rs in a day.

**Family Background**

Name of the Descend: Ms Kharouli Devi W/o Shri Ladan Sahani

Date of death: 13<sup>th</sup> Feb, 2007

Age—65

Working Status: Earlier she use to do labor but later she started begging in village .

**The Family Structure:**

Ms Kharouli Devi has 2 sons, Misri Lal and Anandi Sahni. Age of Misri Sahni is 50 years and Anandi Sahni is handicapped whose age is 43 years. Misri Lal Sahni is married and have 3 sons and 1 daughter. Since Anandik Sahni was handicapped he was not married. He sustains his life by begging. Misri Lal Sahani has 3 sons, Yodha, Vijay, Jay and daughter name is Sharada Sahani. Yodha and Vijay are married. Name of the wife of Yodha is lalo Devi and wife of Vijay is Rinku Devi.

Yodha Sahni has three children those age are 3 years, 4 year and 5 years. Vijay Sahni has 2 children whose age are 3 year and 4 years.

Kharouli Devi W/o Shri Ladan Sahni		
Misri Lal Sahni (50)		Anandi Sahni (43)
Wife-Girija Devi		
Yodha	Vijay	Jay
Unmarried		
Wife-Lalo Devi	(Rinku Devi )	

Descend Ms Kharouli Devi W/o Shri Ladan Sahni's entire family depends on agricultural labor. Earlier she earned money through. But in time being she became physically weak and not in position to physically work then she started begging for livelihood. When labor on farming land could not sustain the family Misri Lal Sahni moved to Muzafferpur as a daily wage worker. By this he earns sometimes Rs 100 per day and sometimes he need to work for only Rs 50 per day. Misri Lal basically the work of *Ghar-Gharari*. In one year Misri Lal gets to work for 4-5 months only. In a year Girija Devi gets the work for 3 months only. Second son of Kharouli Devi is handicapped and he draws his livelihood by begging in the village street by donated tricycle. The entire family member including male and female member are agricultural labor. All these people look their family after spent entire days in the field agriculture labor.

#### **Situation of Different Governmental Schemes:**

##### **Public Distribution System**

Antyodaya and Annpurna Card have given to Ms Kharouli Devi's family but they don't get ration against that cards. When Misri Lal is asked about not getting ration he says that we don't get any benefits of government schemes and facility. Rashan dealer does not give us anything. In a year he gives us grain only once or twice. No one can dare to ask about rashan and if anybody dares to ask for ration he scolds them. Due to not having grains we have to eat sattu only. He showed the coupon of 1-2 years in which they did not get ration except only one two occasion. Misri Lal Sahni says that when we go to take ration, dealer takes the entire old coupon and gives the ration of one month. This is the situation of all the Pasvans families in the village. All the Pasvans and the Dalits of the village complains that they don't get ration regularly.

- The reason for not getting of grains on Antyodaya and Annpurna, Sarpanch Ramnath Jamadar says that due to BDO and Rashan dealer none of the dalits gets ration. We met BDO several times but up till now he has not taken any action against Rashan dealer Basant Singh.
- When Mukhia Shri Ambika Pasvan is asked about not getting rashan of Antyodaya and Annpurna card holders, he says that we don't recruit the dealer. On the demand of villagers 4-5 times we have given the written application to BDO against dealer but BDO does not take action on dealer. What more we can do than giving written application to BDO. Whenever we asked to Mukhiya if rashan dealer Mr Basant Singh cannot be ousted then why not you people give *Dharna* and protest. Than Mukhia could not speak anything.
- Taking all these issues when turn came to meet Basant Singh people were reluctant about this. The terror of Basant Singh is very much in the village. When we met Mr. Basant Singh at 2.30 PM he was totally drunk. Even he was not in the condition to talk us. In the Moment of conversation started he took us to his room and tried to give bribe. When he saw we are not taking it he fell on our legs and said that you are like my younger brothers. He said that what I can do. I could have distributed ration every month but I have to send big amount to junior and senior officers in the block and district level. On the other side villagers are against me because

I come from Bhumihar caste. These all gives me lot of mental agony. Before I had a criminal background. But now I have changed myself. When he was asked that why do you give ration only for 2 months instead of giving every months in a year, he says that, if I distribute ration every months then would I be able to give bribe to upper people.

- When we met the Principal Assistant of District Supply Office and told him every thing and he was shown the coupon of one year, he quickly gave the order to enquiry and produces the report about rashaan dealer Mr Basant Singh.
- Taking this issue when we talked to Assistant District Supply Officer, he told that I don't have any knowledge about corruption done by Basant Singh. But we will try to gather information about him. He reiterated that at present I am Assistant District Supply Officer and I became District Supply Officer for 2 months only. I don't have any information about that. District Supply Officer said that I don't know about this incidence. If people get coupon I will check this incidence. After this District Supply Officer says that lets assume death was due to unavailability of ration, but we don't know about this, media gives the news just like that.

## **NREGA**

Misri Lal Sahni says that we did not get any Government Schemes and facility up till now. We went to Mukhia to make the job card under NREGA but still we are waiting for the card. If job card is made and we would have got employment on that, why should we go out from the village? When we go outside we have to live on road. If we don't get employment we have to spend money earned before.

Another members of Kharouli Devis families Yodha and Vijay says if we had job card and would have got employment on that we had not been under so much mental agony.

Most of the people in the village does not have job Card. Mukhia Ambika Pasvan says that if somebody gives the application for job card his card will be made. We cannot make card on our own wish.

## **Mid Day Meal**

Children of Descend Ms Kharouli Devi's family are less than 5 years so they don't get the benefit of Mid Day Meal scheme.

## **ICDS**

Only one Anganbari Centre runs in this village. Children of Kharouli Devi donot go to this centre. Rinku Devi is a pregnant woman who says that we only get chocolate when we go to centre and sometimes we get *Khichari*.

When we went to Anganbari centre, Anganbari Sevika said that adequate food does not come from the government. That's why we are not able to give nutritious food to pregnant women.

## **Indira Avas Yojana**

We got this benefit before 15 years. But now family has become big and Now all family members facing problem in living in such a small house.

## **Disability**

Younger son of descend Ms Kharouli Devi, Mr. Anandi Sahni is totally handicapped. He has got tricycle from government on which he goes in the village street for begging which is the main source of livelihood. Still he does not get any governmental benefit being a handicapped.

### **National Maternity Benefit Scheme**

Mr. Vijay Sahni's wife is pregnant but she is not getting any benefits of Maternity Benefit Scheme.

### **Wage**

Misri lal Sahni does the work of *Ghar Gharami* when he goes outside in Muzafferpur for work. He gets work for 4-5 months and earn only Rs. 80-100 per day. Rests of the family members, Yodha, Vijay, Jay, Lalo, and Rinku Devi all are agricultural labor. These also get work for 4 months in a year and Rs 30 per day.

### **National Family Benefit Scheme**

Descend Ms Kharouli Devi's families could not get the benefit of this scheme after the death of Kharouli Devi. Misri lal Sahni tried to take the benefit of this scheme and accuses Mukhia for not getting the benefit of this scheme.

### **Common Support**

After the death of Kharouli Devi her family did not get any support from government or Village community.

**Short Term:** MLA sent 400 Rs only

**Mid Term Long Term:** They did not get any help from District administration or block administration.

### **Property**

- Monthly earning of this family is Rs 2000.
- They don't have any private property.
- House is also made on governmental land.
- They don't have any bank account.
- They don't have any animal.
- No movable or immovable property.

### **Health and Food**

Today family of Late Kharouli Devi is eating for two times. At present all the members of the family are drawing their livelihood by doing labour. In meal they use chapatti, Sattu and Rice. In the morning they eat Rice, during day time sattu and at night chapatti. Health of the whole family is almost .Children and women do not get food to eat so they look weak. For eg Rinku Devi being pregnant also does not get nutritious food. Her body is always paining and there is always vomiting tendency with her.

### **Reason of Death**

The officier are not ready to give any explanation on starvation death of Ms Kharouli Devi. But family members and villagers believe this is the starvation death.

Six months before her death Kharouli devi had started begging. At the time of death her handicapped son Anandi Sahni was there in the house. Suddenly she had an attack of Fever, she became so weak So she was not in the condition of begging also. She could not eat anything

because she could not beg. Last four days she was hungry and at last fighting with hunger and finally she died. Mr. Jay kumar Sahni of this village says that when I was passing by her house she asked me for food and I gave her the food, after that I also could not do anything for her. Her Younger son Anandi use to beg and eat all of that he use to beg. This way she was hungry when she died.

Mukhia of the village Ambika Pasvan does not take it as hunger death but death due to illness.

Common People have lots of expectation from the Mukhiya because Mukhiya comes from same village and society. But when Mukhiya himself pact with govt officers for wrongly proof to Starvation death causes then quite natural common people lost the faith in current system. Another side like Rashan shopkeeper Mr. Basant Singh who criminal background, if not be framed by government and taken action against him then bursting situation can be come.

## Starvation death Report of Dobhi block (Gaya)

### Case Study no. - 6

Gaya has been a deeply rooted social, Political and spiritual place, many people called *Gayaji*. In Hindu religion Spiritual bound that as long as we don't do *Pind Dan* in Gaya our ancestors cannot get salvation. People pay *Pind Dan* so that their ancestors will get freedom from Pret Yoni. But in reality, living people who is fighting for the life, don't get sufficient food to survive. Gaya is not only known for the *Pind Dan* but Gaya is also known as Bodh Gaya where Lord Budha got his enlightenment and spreaded his philosophy of how to live a happier life. has been an old political and religious centre which people call by love *Gayaji*. From here Goutam Buddha gave the call of Social Equality and friendship. Today in this town only people are dieing of hunger. According to one non governmental data there has been a death of more than 20 people in Gaya District. in these 3 years due to hunger. Alone in Domi block more than 6 people have died of hunger. People dying of hunger include women, children,old people, youngsters.

From Gaya at the distance of 35-40 Km Domi block is situated. From Domi block GT road comes out. On GT (14) going 2Km east there is Suryamandal turning. Going 2Km south of Suryamandal turning village Banvara comes. In this village in the family of Tulsi Manjhi 3 people died within two days due to hunger. Late Gita Devi, Late Sumita Devi and one six year child is also there.. In this block only in Gamharia village of Agara Panchayat, Vinod Mandal (30 years) died of hunger on April 2005. In the same village Mahachandra Mandal (55 years) died of hunger on june 26. Two sons of Majhachandra Mandal, Dharmendra (15years) and Saryug (20) are still there and wife Bedami Devi is still living. The oldest city of the country, in good governance more than 20 people have died of hunger alone in Gaya. When I tried to know that how big issue they think is hunger death, I came to the conclusion that none of the parties like, BJP, Congress, RJD, have made hunger death a election issue.

The president Sunil Kumar of BJP in Gaya District holds the view that very few have died of hunger. If any poor dies of illness, opposition makes it a hunger death. Sunil Kumar Singh says that in our reign people use to get grains. Before they did not get this much also.

Congress President of Gaya district Chiraguddim Rehman says that BJP government has done treachery with the poor. If our government comes in centre atleast nobody will die of hunger. Chiraguddin Rehman says that whenever I hear that in some village somebody has died of hunger, I go there and meet the Mukhia and BDO and make arrangement for that family to survive.

Members of RJD says that on one side government is making MahaDalit Commission and on the other side Mahadalits are dying of hunger. Then on what account Nitis Kumar says that area is developing.

Niranjan Kumar, candidate from Gaya District of CPI(ML) says that hunger death are due to wrong policy of government. This government is being run by feudal lords and criminals. All the money meant for development is consumed by these people only. Poor and labour class donot get Ration also. In Gaya district where ever hunger death takes place our party become active and launches a movement against it. We try to help the victims family.

Although in Gaya only more than 20 people have died of hunger but the incident of Banvara village has shaken everybody. In this village in the family of Tulsi Manjhi 3 people have died with in 2 days period by hunger. Person died are Late Gita Devi (45), Late Sumita Devi (26) and one six days child. This incident spreaded all over the town and wasting no time BDO came and gave 10,000 Rs as family welfare and Mukhia gave 20 Kg Rice and 10 Kg Ata. After this they have not got anything.

Suryamandal turning situated on GT(14) road, 2Km south to that is village Banvara. In this village 30 houses are of Bhuiya. One house is of Bania and one house is of Bhumihar. All the land of the

village has been captured by one family of Bhumihaar. Most of Bhuiya family doesn't have land of their own. Family of Tulsi also doesn't have land of their own. On the name of property they don't have anything.

Father of Tulsi Manjhi is Karu Manjhi. Late Karu Manjhi has five sons. Girja, Tulsi, Jethan, Chhathu and Vifan. Wife of Girja is Urmila Devi, wife of Tulsi is late Gita Devi, wife of Jethan is Bhagvania Devi, wife of Chhathu is Fulkumari Devi and wife of Vifan is Renu Devi. All the five sons of Karu Manjhi live separately. Girja Manjhi has two sons and two daughters, Tulsi Manjhi has five sons, Jethan Manjhi has three sons and one daughter, Vifan Manjhi has three sons. Chhathu Manjhi does not have any children. Death due to hunger took place in Tulsi Manjhi's family, second son of Karu Manjhi.

Name of the wife of Tulsi Manjhi is late Gita Devi. Tulsi Manjhi has four sons—Ranvilas, Umesh, Arjun, Sarjun. Wife of Ranvilas Manjhi is late Sumita Devi. People dying of hunger was Tulsi Manjhi's wife Gita Devi and wife of Ranvilas Sumita Devi and 6 days child of Ranvilas Karu Manjhi

Girja Manjhi	Tulsi Manjhi	Jethan Manjhi	Chhathu	Vifan
Urmila	Gita	Bhagvania	Fulkumari	Renu
Ranvilas	Umesh	Arjun	Sarjun	

Sumita Devi

6 days child

In the family of Tulsi Manjhi in October 2006 in the period of two days only three people died. On first day Gita Devi wife of Tulsi Manjhi and 6 days child of Ranvilas. On second day Sumita Devi wife of Ranvilas died of hunger.

When asked about reason of death Tulsi Manjhi says that the area was under the clutches of draught. There was no grain in the house and no money also. We were searching for labour by going round the village but of no use. Whole family was eating one time in a day from more than three months. Suddenly Gita Devi and Sumita Devi started suffering from fever. Doctor was doing the treatment, amid their condition worsened. Since there was no money and no grain in the house condition became terrible. Then Gita Devi died first and then Sumita Devi. Tulsi Manjhi says that we had taken for granted that this time draught will kill everybody in the family. Son of Tulsi Manjhi Umesh says that today after two years nothing has changed. 20 days in a month we get to eat two times and on other days we have to suffice with one time meal.

Asked about health and fooding, Tulsi Manjhi says that time being my health is alright. But Urmila Manjhi says that these people are young but since they don't get to eat they look like old person. Tulsi Manjhi says that recently he took a child to hospital but there is no medicine available.

Asked about fooding Tulsi Manjhi becomes sad and says that for us rice and water coming out of it is enough. Sometimes when we get some labour to do and we get money, we buy Dal. We are not able to buy fruits, vegetables, and meat if we wish also. Whole family picks up the wood particles and make food on Chulha made of mud. If there is no wood particles food is made by cow dung.

Resident of Domi block Kamakhya Prasad Singh is a social worker and works for poors of this block only. Kamakhya ji says that these people get employment in January, February, September and October ( when sowing Dhan and when it is cut). On other days they don't get employment and they sleep with hungry stomach. Mukhia and BDO steals all the grain. These people sometimes die of hunger, sometimes due to poverty and sometimes due to illness. Government has no worry for them. If in this area poverty is not eradicated Naxalism will spread very fastly.

## **Situation Of Various Governmental Scheme**

### **PDS**

Family of Tulsi Manjhi have both Antyodaya Card and Annapurna Card. But in one year they have got ration only for two months. When ever these people go to ration dealer he sends them back by saying that ration has not come from State Government.

- When I tried to talk with ration dealer, I could not find him. But his family members says that we distribute ration every month.
- When I asked Mukhia Ashok Singh about not getting ration regularly he said that I have not heard any complain about ration dealer uptill now. If you say like that I will ask him about what you say. Ration dealer distributes ration every month. When people will not come to take ration then should we go there house?
- About not getting of ration Jethan Manjhi, brother of Tulsi Manjhi says that whenever we go to ration dealer we are not able to trace him. If we somehow get him he says that ration has not come from government. Do I give it from my house? Accusation of not getting ration in Banvara village is on Bhuiya. Gola Manjhi of this village says that on one side we face draught and on the other side government does not distribute ration. In this way how we will survive

In this block on the name of ration and kerosene Communist Parties always do movement. Member of Communist Party Kumar says that all the ration and kerosene is stolen by ration and kerosene dealer and Mukhia. At the time of election only ration is distributed and in other months it is all zero.

- On the question of ration and Kerosene when I talked with NGO, they said that we don't work in Domi block. They say that this is Naxalite effected area so we are not able to work here.
- When I talked with Khurshid Anvar Siddiki, who is BDO of Domi block, about irregularities in distribution of ration he said that uptill now no complain has been heard about ration dealer. If somebody does not get ration and complains for that, direct action will be taken on ration dealer.

### **National Family Benefit Scheme**

According to this scheme family of Tuisi Manjhi at the time of death got 10,000 Rs and 30 Kg rice and after that they have not got anything from BDO. Tulsi Manjhi accuses BDO that at that time he told that you will get land, ration, house but till today we have not got anything more than Rs 10,000. One block level journalist Anil Kumar says that this incident does not cover much area for that time being BDO declared many thing but victims has not got anything.

### **Mid Day Meal**

Children of Tulsi Manjhi donot go to school so they donot get advantage of Mid Day Meal scheme. Tulsi Manjhi says that when children will have money to eat and cloths to wear then only they can go to school. At present they pickup wood particles for preparing food for the family.

### **Indra Avas Yojana**

Tulsi Manjhi has not got house under Indra Avas Yojna. Tulsi Manjhi says that whenever he goes to Mukhia Ashok Singh for Indra Avas he makes the excuse that house has nit come on his name. Bhola Manjhi of this village accuses that one who gives bribe to Mukhia and BDO, they only get the

facility of Indra Avas. Bhola Manjhi accuses that why uptill now Tulsi Manjhi not got any facility? Is there anybody more poor than Tulsi Manjhi in this Panchayat? Mukhia Ashok Singh says that there name has been sponsored and when their name will pass for Indra Avas they will get this facility.

## **NREGA**

Family of Tulsi Manjhi has job card but on this they have got job for 5 days only. They got employment for Nahar Ki Katae and that also at the rate of Rs75.

When Mukhia Ashok Singh was asked about not getting 100 days work in a year, he says that when work will come from government then only I can give job to the needy. When employment comes I try to give job to every labourer.

## **Wages and Employment**

In this area all the labourers are basically farmer. Tulsi Manjhi says that mostly we get work in the field only. Under NREGA we get the job of cutting mud. When these people work in the field cost of their labour is 3 Kg Rice and one time food. They get job in Sep-Oct at the time of sowing Dhan and in Jan-Feb at the time of cutting Dhan. After cutting Dhan from 12 sack they get one sack as wage. People sell this and makeup their living. From October to December and from March to August they do not have any work and in these months their condition becomes miserable. Since this is a Naxal effected area there is no governmental facility available here. They do not get work although NREGA is for them.

## **Drinking Water**

In whole village there are three governmental Handpump in which two are out of use. Tulsi Manjhi says that Handpump which is there gives yellow water. Before we use to take water from this Handpump and we use to suffice with that only. Now people have dug wells near their house and all family work is done by that.

## **Primary Health Centre**

In Banpura village there is no facility of primary health centre. For there treatment they have to go to Hospital situated in Domi block. Villagers complain that there is no governmental facility available there. Tulsi Manjhi says that we have to do our treatment outside and we have to buy medicine outside only.

## **Disability**

In Tulsi Manjhis family nobody is disable by body.

## **National Maternity Benefit Scheme**

In Tulsi Manjhis house child is born at the house only and don't have any knowledge of this scheme

## **Old Age Pension Order NOAPS**

In Tulsi Manjhis house everybody is less than 50 years of age so they don't get the facility of Old Age Pension Scheme.

## **Anganbari (ICDS) Centre**

Not a single Anganbari Centre in village Banvara. Due to this children of Tulsi Manjhis family are not able to go to Anganbari Centre.

Observing Tulsi Manjhis house it seems that they lack sufficient food materials. They don't get ration under PDS also they do not get job under NREGA. It is a black mark on the face of governmental scheme that three person died of hunger in Tulsi Manjhis house. If governmental scheme are not justifiably given to needy people, in coming future condition will be very horrific.

General people have lots of expectations from their Mukhia as he is from their village and society. But if Mukhia only doesnot give attention to sensitive matter such as hunger death and try to prove it wrong, the faith of general people in Mukhia breaks. On the other hand people like Basant Singh (Ration dealer) are not stopped at the correct time coming future is very dark.

**Team Visit—April 2009**

**Starvation death Report of Bachhwara block (Begusarai)**  
**Case no. 7**

Chamatha Village in Bahhwara Block is 22 km far away district town Begusarai. In this village Balgovind Pasvan died with hunger on 1<sup>st</sup> august, 2006. Murli Tola is on Bugusarai National Highway. From Murli Tola passing through Rutabaga from there at 10 Km away is Rajachowk. Crossing the bridge situated at Raja Chowk the area of village Chamatha Starts. Descend Balgovind Pasvans house is opposite to Communist main Office.

Chamatha village is economically and socially adequate. The richness of this village could be seen from the big market here. Two category of people can be seen in this village. On One side rich feudal lords (Bhumihar, Rajput) and on the other side 30-35 families of Pasvan's. Economic, social and political all the three has been captured by feudal lords. The economic and social inequality is also a cause of Balgovinds death.

Descend Balgovind Pasvan was a labor and sometimes pull the cycle rickshaw also. In early days, Balgovind Paswan was healthy and physically strong. Entire family liabilities came on Balgovind Paswan. He started to work day-night for family livelihood. But when Mr Balgovind Paswan crossed 40s and getting weak and sick cause of insufficient of food still he did not stop the work. After 16 hour work in a day hardly he manages Rs. 30 hardly and sometimes Rs. 50. Even pulling rickshaw he uses to gain not more than 40 -50 Rs. In a month he could not work more than 20 days. Hardly he manages Rs 1000 in a month. His son says that before death, last three months, he was suffering from high fever and cough. He says that we started doing his treatment by buying medicine from medicine shop. All the money in the house was exhausted in the treatment only. Now there was no money and no food in the house. Before the death from one month whole family was eating chapatti made of maize. One week before the death entire family was living with hungry, Balgovind Pasvan did not survive.

- Agricultural labor of the village Balvodhi Ram has family relationship with Balgovind Pasvan. Balvodhi Ram said that in Balgovind house there was no food. I went and gave 5Kg food grain. I couldn't afford more and my friend died of hunger.
- The former Mukhia of the panchayat Hemant Rai says that there was no food in Balgovinds house and we did not have any information about that. If we knew that we must have done something.
- Mukhia of Chamatha Panchayat Navita Devi does not consider it a hunger death. She says that if this person had died due to hunger how could his son be able to feed 100 people in *Bhoj*.
- Ration dealer of the village says that we gave the ration on time. We don't know he died of hunger or illness.
- BDO of Bachhwara block Ms Sangita Singh did not have this information that under the spell of two years there has been any death due to hunger. In future if such incident takes place she gave the word that she will take quick action.
- After the death due to the movement of communist party its news came on TV. Gunanand Jha of Prabhat Khabar says that we did the coverage of this incidence but we could not do the follow up. For this we feel sorry.

Descend Balgovind Pasvan has joint family. His wife's name is Vechhu Devi. She has died before the death of Balgovind Pasvan. Family members do not know the exact year of her death. Balgovind Pasvan has two sons, Ramjeevan Pasvan(35) and Gunu Pasvan(32). Wife of Ramjeevan Pasvan is

Feko Devi. They have two sons whose age is between 1 to 2.5 years. Wife of Ganu Pasvan is Bamyia Devi. Ganu lives in Punjab and he does not come to his village last 4 years. His wife lives in with parents. Ramjeevans family stays in the village. At present Ramjeevan, Feko Devi and their two children live in the village.

Late Balgovind Pasvan (Wife Vechu Devi)  
50 Years

Ramjeevan Pasvan (35)

Ganu Pasvan (32)

(Wife Feko Devi)

(Wife Bamyia)

Ramjeevan Pasvan is basically a laborer but sometimes he pulls Rickshaw also. When he does not get work he pulls rickshaw to accommodate with that. Ramjeevan Pasvan is handicapped from west. But he pull the Cycle Rikshaw. In a month he is able to run rickshaw for 20 to 25 days only. By pulling rickshaw he earns not more than Rs 50. As a total, in a month he is able to earn Rs 1000. From this money he looks after the whole family. When he is asked about his work although he is handicapped he becomes sad and says that nobody else is there to earn in my families. Wife and children are dependent on me, if I don't earn money they will die out of hunger. Ganu Pasvan has nothing to do with the family. He earns in Punjab and spends there.

At present Ramjeevan Pasvan eats Chapattis and vegetable and Rice and vegetable as a meal. Wife use to do the work of labour before but now she does not do that because she has small children and she has to look after them also.

In the family of Ramjeevan Pasvan, health of every member is worsening. Ramjeevan Pasvan is handicapped by west and he always has pain in his leg and hand. His wife also has weakness problem. But somehow he manages food for the wife and children, by pulling rickshaw and also looks after their health.

Descend Balgovind Pasvan does not have any personal property. He does not have land or animal and he does not have any bank account in any bank. He pulls other peoples rickshaw and makes out the money out of that which sustains his family. In one room house whole family stays. There is one *Khatia* and some utensils. Otherwise there is nothing in their house.

## **Situation of different governmental Schemes**

### **Public Distribution System**

Ramjeevan Pasvan has got ration card but he hardly gets ration on that card. When Ramjeevan Pasvan is asked about not getting of ration he says that "I am a poor person and illiterate. I cannot fight with ration dealer. Ration dealer keeps the coupon of three-four month and gives the ration of one month. In ration they give 5 Kg Rice, 5Kg Wheat and three liters kerosene."

- Being the poorest people in the village they don't get ration on red card. Till today their yellow card has not been issued.
- Former Mukhia Hemant Kumar of Chamatha Panchayat says that cause of all these problem is BPL list. There is a provision in the list that person who is above number 13 point will be kept in BPL list and he will get only ration card. Person who is below number 13 point he will be kept in BPL list plus he will get facility of Antyodaya and Annpurna. In BPL person below 10 point will get yellow card. Under this scheme 15 Kg Rice and 10 Kg Wheat is given. But due to error in this list person having land also enjoys this facility. Due to this error grain which should go to poor goes to landlords.
- When I asked Ramdev Poddar, the ration dealer about not getting of ration to many families he said that he distributes ration every month and I send the information to entire village that ration is being distributed. If somebody does not come to take ration that is not my fault. People say

that Ranjeevan Pasvan did not get ration, in this case he should show me the coupon in which month he did not get ration.

- On the question of ration when Mukhia Navita Devi is asked she says that distribution of ration is not my work, dealer should understand that. Asking about yellow card she says that when somebody comes to make yellow card why not we should make it. Ramjeevan pulls rickshaw and earns good money. He does not need ration that's why he does not give application.
- Balvodhi Ram says that error in the BPL list has been done purposely and injustice has been done to poor. As long as it is not corrected none of the poor can get governmental facility.
- Freelancer Amit Kumar of Bagusarai says that media has taken a good coverage of mischief in BPL list. Now people are trying to correct it.
- Organization Mukti Niketan in Chamatha village also did not do any movement taking the case of Ramjeevan or poor not getting of ration and irregularities in BPL list. They have not included this in their agenda also.
- Member of communist party Anjani Kumar of near village of Bacchvara had said that every now and then we do movements on these kinds of issues.
- BDO Ms Sangita Singh initially did not have the information about the hunger death in Chamatha Village. But when she came to know this incident and also that victims family have not got ration from three months and they don't have red card, she immediately made a call to Mukhia and the ration dealer and said that give them all the governmental facility which they demand as a citizen of India.

### **Anganwari Center (ICDS)**

Angan Bari Center is there in this village but children of Ranjeevan Pasvan are too small to go to center.

Ranjeevan Pasvan has no information about this scheme. Ranjeevan Pasvan says that at the time of my father's death BDO gave us Rs 1500 and 20 Kg wheat and Rice but under which scheme I got this that I don't know. When we tried to know the reason that why did not Ranjeevan get the facility of X from BDO, she says that I will take any action only when I will get full information about this incidence.

Ranjeevan Pasvan is handicapped by west. Being handicapped also he has no certificate that he is handicapped. When he was asked about not having the certificate he says that, nobody listens to anybody in the block so I never tried to make any certificate. Organization working in the village Mukti Niketan says that we don't work for handicapped, we work on giving employment to women's

Ranjeevan Pasvan and his wife does not have job card. He said that we went to Mukhia Navita Devi and also gave an application but till now it has not been made. Due to this we could not get 100 days employment in a year.

- When Mukhia Navita Sevi is asked about not of job card she says that he does not have time from pulling rickshaw. He lies that he has given a application. We have given him Indira Avas. If he would have given a application we would have surely given him the job card.
- Former Mukhia of Chamatha panchyat Hemant Kumar Roy says that poor people does not have job card and by chance somebody have they don't get job on that. Poor people when

they Get job they are made to work for 8 days and it is counted as 5 days in place. Hemant Kumar says that as long we don't fight against the corruption in NREGA. Poor people cannot get job.

- On not having job card, BDO Ms Sangita Singh ordered to Mukhia to make job card to every beneficiary.

### Indira Avas Yojna.

Ranjeevan Pasvan has got the benefit of schemes. Under this schmes he got Rs 24,000 from which he made a house of one room.

In the village there is one primary School in which children get food to eat but since children of Ranjeevan Pasvan are too small to go to school, so they don't get this facility.

**Old Age Pension**—Age of Ramjeevan Pasvan is only 35 so he doesn't get the benefit of old age pension scheme.

**Drinking Water**—In front of Ramjeevan Pasvans house there is a hand pump. By this only they make up with water.

We rarely get to see this type of intolerance and inequality in society where on class is fighting for their livelihood and higher class are keeping them devoid of governmental facilities. As long as government does not reaches the poorest of poor and don't give them all the facilities they accrue, the black face cannot be washed away.

### List of Hunger Death:

<i>Details Of Hunger &amp; Starvation Death</i>					
<i>Sr</i>	<i>Name</i>	<i>Address</i>	<i>District</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Remarks</i>
1	<i>Lakhan Bhuiya</i>	<i>Chakail,Rajauli,</i>	<i>Nawada</i>	<i>26.01.06</i>	
2	<i>Dukhan Ram</i>	<i>Vill-Bilauti,Block-Shahpur,Ara</i>	<i>Bhojpur</i>	<i>? .02.06</i>	<i>D.Jagran.Pat-04 &amp; 05.02.06</i>
3	<i>Kiran Devi</i>	<i>W/O-Bansi Das, Vill-Govindpur,Panchayat-Belkhuria,Block-Nathnagar</i>	<i>Bhagalpur</i>	<i>? .04.06</i>	<i>Hindustan-28 &amp; 29.04.06</i>
4	<i>Rukhasana Khatun</i>	<i>D/0-Md.Abdul, Rahman,Vill-Jhola,PS-Amdabad,Katihar</i>	<i>Katihar</i>	<i>17.05.06</i>	<i>Aaj-Patna-18.05.06</i>

5	<i>Sajda Khatun</i>	<i>D/0-Maimuna Khatun/Md.Tahir, Ansary,,Naya Tola ,Block-Phulwary Sarif</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>24.05.06</i>	<i>Dainik Jagaran,Aaj,Patna -24.05.06</i>
6	<i>Unknown Lady</i>	<i>Cement Factory Gate, Dalmiya Nagar</i>	<i>Rohtash</i>	<i>18.07.06</i>	
7	<i>Ravin Kumar Bhagat</i>	<i>AAmarpur Bazar</i>	<i>Banka</i>	<i>24.07.06</i>	<i>Hindustan-25.07.06</i>
8	<i>Lalvi Devi</i>	<i>Sohijan, Katra</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>		<i>DJagran.Muz31.07.06, Hindustan.Muz</i>
					<i>01 &amp; 02 .08.06</i>
9	<i>Balgovind Paswan</i>	<i>Vill-Barkhut, Panchayat - Chamtha-2-,Block-Bachwara</i>	<i>Begusarai</i>	<i>01.08.06</i>	<i>R.Sahara-06.08.06,</i>
					<i>Hindustan.Beg-05.08.06</i>
10	<i>Niece Of Jagdish Kharvar</i>	<i>Jahmat,Panchayat-Darigavn,Sasaram</i>	<i>Rohtash</i>		<i>Dainik Jagaran-Patna-11.08.06,15.08.06, R.Sahara10.08.06, 13.08.06,15.08.06, Hindustan-15.08.06</i>
11	<i>Mantri Chero</i>				
12	<i>Gulab Paswan</i>				
13	<i>Shiva Shah</i>	<i>Panapur-Akhtiyarpur,Marvan</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>		<i>Hindustan.Pat.Muz-02.08.06</i>
14	<i>Anwary Khatun</i>	<i>Mahinawan,Maner</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>13.08.06</i>	
15	<i>Rina Kumary</i>	<i>Tari Khana,Danapur</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>13.08.06</i>	
16	<i>Rinki d/oKrishna Pathalkat</i>	<i>Krishna Pathalkat ,S.B.R.College Mor,Barh</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>13.08.06</i>	<i>R.Sahara14.09.06</i>

17	<i>Kajal d/oKrishna Pathalkat</i>			23.08.06	<i>Rinki,Kajal.Rupa were sisters</i>
18	<i>Rupa d/oKrishna Pathalkat</i>				
19	<i>Bindeshwary Mahto</i>	<i>Bangary,Motipur</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	14.08.06	
20	<i>Budhu Shah</i>	<i>Hardi,Block-Motipur</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	16.08.06	<i>Hindustan-19.08.06, D.Jagran.Muz-18.08.06</i>
21	<i>Bijali Paswan</i>	<i>Bahlolpur,Bochaha</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	19.08.06	<i>Aaj.Pat-23.07.06</i>
					<i>Hindustan.Pat.Muz-02.08.06</i>
22	<i>Chanda Devi</i>	<i>Bhadauna-Nonia Tola, Block-Marvan</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>		<i>Hindustan-Pat/Muz-28.08.06</i>
23	<i>Md.Isahak</i>	<i>Near Sivaipatti Chauk, Madhepur,Minapur</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>		<i>Prabhat Khabar-05.09.06</i>
24	<i>Dukhani Devi w/o-Faggu Sao</i>	<i>c/o--Faggu Sao, Khushal Tola,Barahiya</i>	<i>Lakhisarai</i>	05.09.06	<i>R.Sahara-14.09.06</i>
25	<i>Rajesh s/o-Faggu Sao</i>				<i>Hindustan.Pat-09.09.06</i>
26	<i>Vikash s/o-Faggu Sao</i>				
27	<i>Ashish s/o-Faggu Sao</i>				
28	<i>Girish Ram</i>	<i>Vill-Manikpur,Panchayat-Kawadpur,Block-Suryagarha</i>	<i>Lakhisarai</i>	<i>Sep.06</i>	<i>R.Sahara- ....09.06</i>
29	<i>Satrudhan Pd.</i>	<i>Bihar State Small Scale Industries Ltd.</i>	<i>Patna</i>	05.09.06	<i>Rastrya Sahara,Patna-06.09.06</i>
30	<i>Bahadur Ram</i>	<i>PS-Sadar,Buxer</i>			<i>Hindustan.Pat-09.09.06</i>
31	<i>Hardev Manjhi</i>	<i>Vill-Kochi,Block-Guraru</i>			<i>R.Sahara-12.09.06</i>

					<i>DJagran.Gaya15.0 9.06Hindustan.Pat- 11 &amp; 15 .09.06 Prabhat Khabar 16.09.06</i>
32	<i>Rekha Devi</i>	<i>Bangar,Navkothi</i>	<i>Begusarai</i>	<i>12.09.06</i>	
33	<i>Kuchchi Devi</i>	<i>Lahargavan,Sakra</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>17.09.06</i>	
34	<i>Ram Dayal Chaudhary</i>	<i>Trikol,Block -Sandesh,</i>	<i>Bhojpur</i>	<i>18.09.06</i>	
		<i>Ara</i>			
35	<i>Md.Azim</i>	<i>Vill-Jave,PS+Block-- Bhavanipur,Dhamdaha</i>	<i>Purnia</i>	<i>TuesDay.0 9.06</i>	<i>Dainik Jagaran-</i>
					<i>Hindustan. Bhg/Pat-20.09.06</i>
36	<i>Raja Alam</i>	<i>Vill-Sarffuddinpur- Tonk,Pnchayat- Sarffuddinpur, Bochaha</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>21.09.06</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat- 22.09.06</i>
37	<i>Lakhan Bhuiyan</i>	<i>Vill-Chafel,Block-Rajauli</i>		<i>29.09.06</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat- 30.09.06</i>
38	<i>Khatemun Nisha @ Belwa</i>	<i>M/O-Md.Aziz/Lal Md,</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>		<i>Hindustan.Beg- 03.06.06</i>
		<i>Vill-Vishanpur-Gidha, Panchayat-Madhampur- Susta,Block-Kudhani</i>			
39	<i>Unknown Man</i>	<i>590-Dn.Islampur-Patna Passenger Train</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>30.10.06</i>	<i>R.Sahara31.10.06,</i>
					<i>Hindustan- 31.10.06</i>
40	<i>Barhu Manjhi</i>	<i>Babhna,Town Area, Jahanabad</i>	<i>Jahanabad</i>	<i>17.11.06</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat- 18.11.06</i>
					<i>R.Sahara.Pat- 19.11.06</i>
41	<i>Rasula Khatun</i>	<i>W/O-Md.Safik,</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>20.11.06</i>	

		<i>Vill Jalalpur, Panchayat-Baikathpur, Block-Musahari,</i>			
42	<i>Md.Jamid</i>	<i>S/O-Md.Rasul, RahmanTola, Ramchandra, Basauli Panchayat, Block-Kudhani,</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>23.11.06</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat-24.11.06</i>
43	<i>SatyaNr.Maho</i>	<i>Block-Sarayganj</i>	<i>Samastipur</i>	<i>30.11.06</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat-19.12.06</i>
44	<i>Sonia, w/o-SatyaNr.Maho</i>			<i>16.12.06</i>	<i>Son/Wife/Husband Within 15 Days</i>
45	<i>Guddu, s/o-SatyaNr.Maho</i>				
46	<i>Devraj Sahni</i>	<i>Mushari, Block-Mushari</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>03.02.07</i>	
47	<i>Prabhu Paswan</i>	<i>Vishnpur Jagdish, Block-Bochaha</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>13.02.07</i>	
48	<i>Ratiya Devi</i>	<i>Raghunathpur, Paru</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>13.02.07</i>	
49	<i>Kharauli Devi</i>	<i>Raghunathpur, Paru</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>13.02.07</i>	
50	<i>Mina Devi</i>	<i>Muhammadpur Kothi, Muraul</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>15.02.07</i>	
51	<i>Dhanai Paswan</i>	<i>Bansghat, Motipur</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>16.02.07</i>	
52	<i>Chandrakala Devi</i>	<i>Baluaha, Bochahan</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>28.02.07</i>	
53	<i>Bhikhari Paswan</i>	<i>Amghatta, Dumra</i>	<i>Muzaffarpur</i>	<i>29.05.07</i>	
54	<i>Mantun Mahto</i>	<i>Narepur West, Bachawara</i>	<i>Begusarai</i>	<i>7-Jun</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat-06.09.07</i>
55	<i>Dinanath Yada</i>	<i>Sultanpur, Danapur</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>23.06.07</i>	<i>R.Sahara-24.06.07</i>
56	<i>Shobha w/oDinanath Yadav</i>				
57	<i>Girija Singh</i>	<i>Vill-Baghor, PS-Roh</i>	<i>Nawada</i>	<i>.....07.07</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat-05.07.07</i>
58	<i>Mrs. Girija Sing</i>				
59	<i>Agam s/o GirijaSingh</i>				

60	Mrs.Panna Tanti S/O Panna Tanti	Jamalpur	Munger	10.07.07	Hindustan. Pat.15.07.07 Three of family of Panna Tanti
61	Chaitu Rai	S/o-Jitan Rai,Danapur	Patna	08.08.07	Hindustan.Pat 08.08.07
62	Hardev Paswan	Chiksi Bigaha,Paliganj	Patna	11.08.07	Hindustan.Pat 13.08.07
63	Jaymati Devi	w/o-Jago Binda , Lal Verma Nagar,PS- Rupaspur,Danapur	Patna	.....08.07	Hindustan.Pat.22.0 8.07
64	Jagdish Mahto	F/o-Lalan Mahto, Ward No-11,Rosra	Samastipur	02.09.07	Hindustan.Pat- 04.09.07
65	Pramod Chaudhary	Vill Mano, Suryagarha	Lakhisara	08.09.07	Hindustan.Pat- 08.09.07
66	Bindu, d/oBalram	Sahebpurkamal	Begusarai	04.10.07	Hindustan.Pat- 06.09.07
67	Rita d/oBalram				
68	Simpi d/oBalram				
69	Manisha d/oBalram				
70	MahManishaesh Bhagat	Bathna ,Motipur	Muzaffarpur		
71	Md.Hadish	S/O-Md.Sirajuddin, Ward- 11 Vill-Mornish,Panchayat- Basauli,Block-Kurhani	Muzaffarpur		Hindustan- 31.11.07
72	Sukan Mahto	Bibipur,Paliganj,Patna	Patna	15.01,08	Hindustan.Pat- 17.01.07
73	Mahesh Mahto	Ex.Employee Of Bihar State Forest Dev Corp.	East Champaran	TuesDay.0 1.08	Hindustan.Pat- 31.01.08

		<i>Vill-Shital Patti,PS-Chiraiya</i>			<i>Died In Patna</i>
74	<i>Bhagamania Devi ,w/o-RamJi Mushar</i>	<i>Vill-Majhauri,PS-Bihia,Ara</i>	<i>Bhojpur</i>	<i>02.05.08</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat- 04.05.08</i>
75	<i>Rupa, d/o- RamJi Mushar</i>				
76	<i>Chaiti d/o- RamJi Mushar</i>				
77	<i>Dhuri s/o- RamJi Mushar</i>				
78	<i>Munni Devi</i>	<i>w/o-Durga Shah c/oLalan Shah,Moti Tola,Ara</i>	<i>Bhojpur</i>	<i>25.05.08</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat- 26.05.08</i>
79	<i>Gopal</i>	<i>Vill-Tikulia,Murliganj</i>	<i>Supaul/  Sahrza</i>		<i>Hindustan.Pat-05 &amp; 06.10.08</i>
80	<i>Unknown Person</i>	<i>Sadar Hospital,  Saharsa</i>	<i>Sahrza</i>		<i>Hindustan.Pat-05 &amp; 06.10.08</i>
81	<i>Rama Pd. Rai</i>	<i>Phulwary Depot, Bihar State Transport Corp</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>WednesDa y.Nov.08</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat- 28.11.08</i>
82	<i>Sabita Devi</i>	<i>Bihar State Construction Corp.</i>	<i>Patna</i>		<i>Hindustan.Pat- 18.12.08</i>
83	<i>Mahendra Sharma</i>	<i>s/o Kinnu Sharma, Ward7,  Sharmatola Vill Bharatpur  ,POSurjapur,PanchyatLalga nj,PS-Pratappur</i>	<i>Patna</i>	<i>15.02.09</i>	<i>Hindustan.Pat- 12.01.09</i>
84	<i>Hardev Manjhi</i>	<i>Kochi, Guraru</i>	<i>Gaya</i>	<i>9.9.06</i>	

85	Vinod Bhuiya (2 Person)	<i>Gamharia</i>	Dobhi		
86	One person	<i>Guraru</i>			
87	3 Persons	<i>Fatehpur</i>			
88	Manju Devi-35,	<i>Baskatava, Near Gurpa</i>	Patwas		
89	Thakani Devi--80	84			
90	Naresh-18	<i>Near Gurupa</i>			
91	Chalitar Dome	<i>Ratubigha, Block Ghoshi, District Jahanabad</i>		10.08.09	Sanmarg (14.08.09)
92	Ms kunti Devi	<i>Ratubigha, Block Ghoshi, District Jahanabad</i>		11.08.09	
93	Janardan Mahto	<i>Ratubigha, Block Ghoshi, District Jahanabad</i>		13.08.09	
94	Phoolmanti Devi W/oSarvan majhi	<i>Village Jhamawara, Block Noorsarai, District nlanda</i>		12.08.09	Dainik Jagran (13.08.09)
95	One Year Child	<i>Village Jhamawara, Block Noorsarai, District nlanda</i>		12.08.09	Dainik Jagran (13.08.09)
96	Mother of Sarvan Majhi	<i>Village Jhamawara, Block Noorsarai, District nlanda</i>		27.07.09	

**The main role of the advisor will be**

- a) To send the Commissioner regular updates about the situation in the state.
- b) To convey to the Commissioner any appeal for intervention that may be made in the state.
- c) To work towards a more effective monitoring redressal system with in the state.

In addition, the advisor and the secretariat will also assist in

- i. An analysis of performance of relevant schemes using macro data;
- ii. Response to emergencies, drought, starvation deaths etc.
- iii. Gathering information from the state government on the performance of the relevant schemes and programs.
- iv. Articulating alternative demands regarding state policy especially on hunger.
- v. Preparing periodic state reports.
- vi. Working towards accountability norms for public programs related to food and food security.
- vii. Arranging visits to the commissioner if necessary.
- viii. Liase with local networks, individuals and organizations to gather information's from the district level and other sub-levels.
- ix. Handle other requests that the commissioner may make to them from time to time.
- x. At the request of the commissioner, agree to be a part of various committees pertaining to the orders of the court, or organize suitable alternatives for the same.
- xi. Liase constantly with the government on grievances and grievance redressal processes with in the relevant schemes.